



**Sustainable cities and communities**    **ISO/TC 268**

**Date:**  
**2019-03-11**

**Doc. Number:**  
**N 0432**

**Assistant:**  
Anne-Marie Minhoué  
Direct line :  
annemarie.minhoue@afnor.org

**Your contact:**  
Etienne CAILLEAU  
Direct line : 01 41 62 85 71  
etienne.cailleau@afnor.org

## **Result of the CIB on the registration of a PWI on Small and Medium-sized Cities Collated Comments**

**C**OMMENTARIES /

Dear member,

**D**ECISIONS

Please find below the result of the CIB on the registration a preliminary work item on Small and Medium-sized Cities. The development of this preliminary work item and comments received during the CIB will be discussed within WG 1 Management System Standards during its forthcoming meeting to be held in Paris during ISO/TC 268 week (April 8th to 12th 2019).

**F**OLLOW UP

For information

**S**OURCE

ISO/TC268 Secretariat

## Result of voting

### Ballot Information

<b>Ballot reference</b>	CIB for registration of PWI on Small and Medium-sized Cities
<b>Ballot type</b>	CIB
<b>Ballot title</b>	
<b>Opening date</b>	2019-01-08
<b>Closing date</b>	2019-03-08
<b>Note</b>	

### Member responses:

<b>Votes cast (41)</b>	Algeria (IANOR) Austria (ASI) Barbados (BNSI) Brazil (ABNT) Cameroon (ANOR) Canada (SCC) China (SAC) Côte d'Ivoire (CODINORM) Czech Republic (UNMZ) Denmark (DS) Ecuador (INEN) Egypt (EOS) France (AFNOR) Germany (DIN) India (BIS) Iran, Islamic Republic of (ISIRI) Ireland (NSAI) Israel (SII) Italy (UNI) Japan (JISC) Kazakhstan (KAZMEMST) Kenya (KEBS) Korea, Republic of (KATS) Mauritius (MSB) Mexico (DGN) Morocco (IMANOR) Netherlands (NEN) Niger (DNQM) Nigeria (SON) Norway (SN) Philippines (BPS) Romania (ASRO) Russian Federation (GOST R) Serbia (ISS) South Africa (SABS) Spain (UNE) Sri Lanka (SLSI) Sweden (SIS) United Kingdom (BSI)
------------------------	--

	United States (ANSI) Viet Nam (STAMEQ)
<b>Comments submitted (2)</b>	Australia (SA) ISO/TC 228
<b>Votes not cast (5)</b>	Benin (ANM) Burkina Faso (ABNORM) Greece (NQIS ELOT) Haiti (BHN) Rwanda (RSB)

Questions:	
<b>Q.1</b>	"Do you approve the registration of a Preliminary Work Item (PWI) on "Small and Medium-sized Cities - Guidance for practical implementation of ISO 37101" in the work programme of ISO/TC 268 ? "

Votes by members	Q.1
<b>Algeria (IANOR)</b>	Yes
<b>Austria (ASI)</b>	Abstain
<b>Barbados (BNSI)</b>	Abstain
<b>Brazil (ABNT)</b>	Yes
<b>Cameroon (ANOR)</b>	Abstain
<b>Canada (SCC)</b>	Yes
<b>China (SAC)</b>	Yes
<b>Côte d'Ivoire (CODINORM)</b>	Abstain
<b>Czech Republic (UNMZ)</b>	Abstain
<b>Denmark (DS)</b>	Yes
<b>Ecuador (INEN)</b>	Abstain
<b>Egypt (EOS)</b>	Abstain
<b>France (AFNOR)</b>	Yes
<b>Germany (DIN)</b>	Yes
<b>India (BIS)</b>	Yes
<b>Iran, Islamic Republic of (ISIRI)</b>	Abstain
<b>Ireland (NSAI)</b>	Abstain
<b>Israel (SII)</b>	Yes
<b>Italy (UNI)</b>	Abstain
<b>Japan (JISC)</b>	Yes

<b>Kazakhstan (KAZMEMST)</b>	Abstain
<b>Kenya (KEBS)</b>	Yes
<b>Korea, Republic of (KATS)</b>	Yes
<b>Mauritius (MSB)</b>	Yes
<b>Mexico (DGN)</b>	Abstain
<b>Morocco (IMANOR)</b>	Yes
<b>Netherlands (NEN)</b>	Abstain
<b>Niger (DNQM)</b>	Yes
<b>Nigeria (SON)</b>	Yes
<b>Norway (SN)</b>	Abstain
<b>Philippines (BPS)</b>	Yes
<b>Romania (ASRO)</b>	Yes
<b>Russian Federation (GOST R)</b>	Yes
<b>Serbia (ISS)</b>	Yes
<b>South Africa (SABS)</b>	Abstain
<b>Spain (UNE)</b>	Abstain
<b>Sri Lanka (SLSI)</b>	Abstain
<b>Sweden (SIS)</b>	Yes
<b>United Kingdom (BSI)</b>	Yes
<b>United States (ANSI)</b>	Yes
<b>Viet Nam (STAMEQ)</b>	Yes

Answers to Q.1: "Do you approve the registration of a Preliminary Work Item (PWI) on "Small and Medium-sized Cities - Guidance for practical implementation of ISO 37101" in the work programme of ISO/TC 268 ? "

<b>24 x</b>	<b>Yes</b>	<b>Algeria (IANOR)</b> <b>Brazil (ABNT)</b> <b>Canada (SCC)</b> <b>China (SAC)</b> <b>Denmark (DS)</b> <b>France (AFNOR)</b> <b>Germany (DIN)</b> <b>India (BIS)</b> <b>Israel (SII)</b> <b>Japan (JISC)</b> <b>Kenya (KEBS)</b> <b>Korea, Republic of (KATS)</b> <b>Mauritius (MSB)</b> <b>Morocco (IMANOR)</b> <b>Niger (DNQM)</b>
-------------	------------	--

		<b>Nigeria (SON)</b> <b>Philippines (BPS)</b> <b>Romania (ASRO)</b> <b>Russian Federation (GOST R)</b> <b>Serbia (ISS)</b> <b>Sweden (SIS)</b> <b>United Kingdom (BSI)</b> <b>United States (ANSI)</b> <b>Viet Nam (STAMEQ)</b>
<b>0 x</b>	<b>No</b>	
<b>17 x</b>	<b>Abstain</b>	<b>Austria (ASI)</b> <b>Barbados (BNSI)</b> <b>Cameroon (ANOR)</b> <b>Czech Republic (UNMZ)</b> <b>Côte d'Ivoire (CODINORM)</b> <b>Ecuador (INEN)</b> <b>Egypt (EOS)</b> <b>Iran, Islamic Republic of (ISIRI)</b> <b>Ireland (NSAI)</b> <b>Italy (UNI)</b> <b>Kazakhstan (KAZMEMST)</b> <b>Mexico (DGN)</b> <b>Netherlands (NEN)</b> <b>Norway (SN)</b> <b>South Africa (SABS)</b> <b>Spain (UNE)</b> <b>Sri Lanka (SLSI)</b>

Comments from Voters		
Member:	Comment:	Date:
<b>Brazil (ABNT)</b>	<b><i>Comment File</i></b>	2019-02-28 18:55:08
<a href="#">CommentFiles/CIB for registration of PWI on Small and Medium-sized Cities_ABNT.doc</a>		
<b>France (AFNOR)</b>	<b><i>Comment File</i></b>	2019-03-08 21:51:33
<a href="#">CommentFiles/CIB for registration of PWI on Small and Medium-sized Cities_AFNOR.doc</a>		
<b>Germany (DIN)</b>	<b><i>Comment File</i></b>	2019-03-01 07:50:10
<a href="#">CommentFiles/CIB for registration of PWI on Small and Medium-sized Cities_DIN.doc</a>		
<b>India (BIS)</b>	<b><i>Comment File</i></b>	2019-02-25 05:27:14
<a href="#">CommentFiles/CIB for registration of PWI on Small and Medium-sized Cities_BIS.doc</a>		

Comments from Commenters		
Member:	Comment:	Date:
<b>Australia (SA)</b>	<b><i>Comment</i></b>	2019-03-08 06:43:13

Abstain		
<b>ISO/TC 228</b>	<b><i>Comment</i></b>	2019-01-09 12:47:29
we approve the project		

# Template for comments and secretariat observations

Date:2019-03-09

Document: N432

Project: PWI SMC

MB/ NC <sup>1</sup>	Line number	Clause/ Subclause	Paragraph/ Figure/Table	Type of comment <sup>2</sup>	Comments	Proposed change	Observations of the secretariat
DE 001					<p>The CIB on the registration of a Preliminary Work Item Proposal on Small and Medium-sized Cities (Guidance für practical implementation of ISO 37101) can generally be approved.</p> <p>However, some specification on the study subject is needed.</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. The definition of small/medium sized cities varies not only according to their actual number of inhabitants (see 4.2 - UN/OECD/China-criteria, pages 4-5), but also in correspondence to the specific regional structure. For example, the structures of SMCs in the German industrial "Ruhrgebiet" are unlike those in rural areas like Brandenburg.</li> <li>2. The suggested importance of reference objectives (see 4.2 - page 7) have to be adjusted. Especially for SMCs in the Euregios (e. g. at the German-BeNeLux and German-French borders), inter-regional cooperation is essential.</li> <li>3. Digitization as an important objective is missing.</li> <li>4. SMCs do not have generally comparatively weak economic foundation, lack of resources and professional talents (see 4.2 - page 8). In Europe, university towns are very often very attractive SMCs that face different problems from industrial towns.</li> </ol>	<p>Please specify the definition / define different clusters.</p> <p>Please reconsider the indicated value to this objective.</p> <p>Please amend this objective.</p> <p>Please reconsider this conclusion.</p>	

<sup>1</sup> **MB** = Member body / **NC** = National Committee (enter the ISO 3166 two-letter country code, e.g. CN for China; comments from the ISO/CS editing unit are identified by \*\*)

<sup>2</sup> **Type of comment:** **ge** = general **te** = technical **ed** = editorial

## Template for comments and secretariat observations

Date:2019-03-09

Document: N432

Project: PWI SMC

MB/ NC <sup>1</sup>	Line number	Clause/ Subclause	Paragraph/ Figure/Table	Type of comment <sup>2</sup>	Comments	Proposed change	Observations of the secretariat
					5. Mutual exchanges between SMCs (see 4.3.2 – page 9) are common practise and a very important political issue throughout Europe (e. g. Horizon 2020, Lighthouse Cities) and Germany (Erprobungsräume, Modellkommunen, Netzwerk Digitaler Städte, ...).	Please reconsider the indicated value to this task.	
DE 002					Selection of UN Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs) It appears against the logic of the SDG's that the proposal does not intend to deliver against eg. SDG 1,2,5,10,14,16. If striving for 'sustainable small- and medium-sized cities, these SDG's necessarily will need to be addressed, as well.		
DE 003					It is not entirely clear, how the proposed standard will be different or add value to ISO/FDIS 37104		
DE 004					“Small and medium-sized cities (SMC), with a population of up to around 500,000, represent the largest number among global cities, with independent authorities, economy, culture, and infrastructure, etc., whilst having obvious suburban or agricultural transition areas with other urban areas. It is a vital force to promote the development of national economy, an important link between cities and countryside as well as a strategic fulcrum for the overall development of urban and rural areas” 500.000 inhabitants, according to German and European standards are 'large cities'. It is not clear how the concept of 'small and medium-sized cities' could respect the regional variety of actual figures relating to 'small- and medium-sized' – eg. in Germany, this will include cities with up to 100.000 inhabitants.		

1 **MB** = Member body / **NC** = National Committee (enter the ISO 3166 two-letter country code, e.g. CN for China; comments from the ISO/CS editing unit are identified by \*\*)

2 **Type of comment:** **ge** = general **te** = technical **ed** = editorial

## Template for comments and secretariat observations

Date:2019-03-09

Document: N432

Project: PWI SMC

MB/ NC <sup>1</sup>	Line number	Clause/ Subclause	Paragraph/ Figure/Table	Type of comment <sup>2</sup>	Comments	Proposed change	Observations of the secretariat
FR 005				Ge	Small and Medium Sized Cities clearly falls under ISO/TC 268 activities and especially within WG 1. The French mirror committee recognizes the interest to work on the subject of Small and Medium Sized Cities as an interesting and relevant topic. Nevertheless, it is considered that some aspects of the proposal has to be further developed prior to consider the activation of the WI. The activation of the WI should not be considered prior the resolution of the following aspects/questions.	Please consider the following comments prior thinking about the activation of the WI.	
FR 006				Ge	The definition of a small and medium sized cities has to be better described. The relative position from a city to another seems to be the appropriate approach to describe shared challenges for Small and Medium Sized Cities.	Please ensure that the definition of Small and Medium Sized and their challenges are shared globally.	
FR 007				Ge	In the current proposal, there is currently no additional dedicated tool for Small and Medium Sized Cities.	In order to be used the proposed standard has to include practical dedicated tools that are relevant for Small and Medium Sized Cities.	
FR 008				Ge	The current hierarchy of challenges that are facing SMC has to be discussed in order to see if they are shared globally.	Ensure the global relevance of the document.	
FR 009				Ge	It should be better described how this new guidance will be positioned in regards to ISO 37101 and ISO 37104 in order to ensure clarity for users and being sure that the overall requirements from ISO 37101 are taken into account.	By developing this new guidance document, please ensure consistency with ISO 37101 requirements on the first hand and also its relative position to ISO 37104.	
DE 010		06.02 / Annexes 1 and 2			Section 6.2 of the proposed draft: Selection of performance indicators of sustainable development and implementation methods / Annex 1 / Annex 2  Indicators within 371xx are provided through ISO 37120:2018; 37122; 37123. It will be confusing to include indicators in this new proposed standard for		

1 **MB** = Member body / **NC** = National Committee (enter the ISO 3166 two-letter country code, e.g. CN for China; comments from the ISO/CS editing unit are identified by \*\*)

2 **Type of comment:** **ge** = general **te** = technical **ed** = editorial

# Template for comments and secretariat observations

Date:2019-03-09

Document: N432

Project: PWI SMC

MB/ NC <sup>1</sup>	Line number	Clause/ Subclause	Paragraph/ Figure/Table	Type of comment <sup>2</sup>	Comments	Proposed change	Observations of the secretariat
					cities, which should be encouraged to used the above mentioned ones, rather. Thus, the standard should avoid developing / presenting new indicators but only include a 'how to' use the indicators provided in the ISO 37120-37123.		
BR 011	Page 15	Annex 1: Example of Cross Analysis Matrix between indicators and purposes and issues	Figure	ge	It is not intuitive that the numbers inside the balloons refer to the numbers referred to the six purposes of ISO 37101.	Specify the first column as the purposes of ISO37101, the first line as its 12 issues and the contents of the "Cross Analysis Matrix" as the numbers referred to the six purposes.	
BIS 012	Page 1	Foreword Box titled 'Necessity on compiling practical implementati on guidance for SMC'	2nd Bullet in Para 2	te	This bullet calls the issues of 'poverty, air pollution, lack of public services and infrastructures, urban sprawl' as 'disease', which is not an appropriate term. There are other editorial issues also with Line 1 of this bullet. For example, the phrase 'number of poverty' is not correct. Therefore, Line 1 should be replaced by a more appropriate draft.	Replace the beginning part of Line 1, which currently reads as "Rapid urbanization causes lots of city diseases in metropolis, such as increasing number of poverty, ....."  With the following:  'Rapid urbanization causes many challenges for sustainable development and management in metropolises, such as increasing poverty, .....	
BIS 013	Page 1	Foreword	Paragraph 1 Line 6		Under the title "Purpose and justification of the proposal", on Page 4, it is stated that this proposal shall address the identified SGDs, which do not include the SDG Nos.1,2,5,10,14&16. Thus this proposal would address 11 out of 17 SDGs.	Replace the number '17' with the '11 out of 17'.	
BIS 014	Page 1	Foreword	Title	ed	The title should read as 'Foreword' instead of 'Forward'.	Replace the title as 'Foreword' instead of 'Forward'.	

1 **MB** = Member body / **NC** = National Committee (enter the ISO 3166 two-letter country code, e.g. CN for China; comments from the ISO/CS editing unit are identified by \*\*)

2 **Type of comment:** **ge** = general **te** = technical **ed** = editorial

# Template for comments and secretariat observations

Date:2019-03-09

Document: N432

Project: PWI SMC

MB/ NC <sup>1</sup>	Line number	Clause/ Subclause	Paragraph/ Figure/Table	Type of comment <sup>2</sup>	Comments	Proposed change	Observations of the secretariat
BR 015	Page 3	Forward - Necessity on compiling practical implementati on guidance for SMC	"Table" 2	ed	It is not clear the meaning of the "star" symbol when comparing the urgent needs of SMC with features of metropolis.	Include the "star" symbol and its description in the NOTE as for the "heart" symbol.	
BR 016	Page 2	Forward - Necessity on compiling practical implementati on guidance for SMC	"Table" 1 "Table" 2	ed	It is not clear the meaning of the "star" symbol when comparing the urgent needs of SMC with features of metropolis.	Include the "star" symbol and its description in the NOTE as for the "heart" symbol.	
BIS 017	Page 5	Population classification of SMC cities	Penultimate paragraph	te	As this is a global document, reference to the China standard may be avoided.	Delete the following paragraph:  'According to current China standard, small cities are that of population less than 500,000, including small city I (200,000-500,000) and small city II (less than 200,000). Medium cities are that of population 500,000-1,000,000.'	
BIS 018	Page 5	Population classification of SMC cities	Penultimate paragraph (to be introduced)	te	The document should also address the habitats that are below 50,000 inhabitants. These can be called as 'town'.	Add the following paragraph before the last paragraph:  "Habitats that are below 50,000 inhabitants can be called as 'towns'."	
BIS 019	Page 8	This proposal will be developed by:		te	India has a large urban population, of 377 million (2011), of which small and medium cities, having population of 100,000 and below, is as much as 112 million. The next higher level of medium towns, having population between 100,000 and 1,000,000 is 104 million. The number of SMCs in India is over 3,000.  Keeping in view its large share in the global population of SMCs, India may be included in the Working Group.	For the statement which currently reads as follows: "This proposal will be developed by:  <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> An existing Working Group (please specify which one: ISO/TC268/WG1)" substitute the following: " <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> To be determined"	

1 **MB** = Member body / **NC** = National Committee (enter the ISO 3166 two-letter country code, e.g. CN for China; comments from the ISO/CS editing unit are identified by \*\*)

2 **Type of comment:** **ge** = general **te** = technical **ed** = editorial

## Template for comments and secretariat observations

Date:2019-03-09

Document: N432

Project: PWI SMC

MB/ NC <sup>1</sup>	Line number	Clause/ Subclause	Paragraph/ Figure/Table	Type of comment <sup>2</sup>	Comments	Proposed change	Observations of the secretariat
------------------------	----------------	----------------------	----------------------------	---------------------------------	----------	-----------------	------------------------------------

1 **MB** = Member body / **NC** = National Committee (enter the ISO 3166 two-letter country code, e.g. CN for China; comments from the ISO/CS editing unit are identified by \*\*)

2 **Type of comment:** **ge** = general **te** = technical **ed** = editorial

## Template for comments and secretariat observations

Date:2019-03-09	Document: N432	Project: PWI SMC
-----------------	----------------	------------------

MB/ NC <sup>1</sup>	Line number	Clause/ Subclause	Paragraph/ Figure/Table	Type of comment <sup>2</sup>	Comments	Proposed change	Observations of the secretariat
------------------------	----------------	----------------------	----------------------------	---------------------------------	----------	-----------------	------------------------------------

CIB for registration of PWI on Small and Medium-sized Cities\_ABNT.doc: Collation successful

CIB for registration of PWI on Small and Medium-sized Cities\_AFNOR.doc: Collation successful

CIB for registration of PWI on Small and Medium-sized Cities\_BIS.doc: Collation successful

CIB for registration of PWI on Small and Medium-sized Cities\_DIN.doc: Collation successful

Collation of files was successful. Number of collated files: 4

SELECTED (number of files): 4

PASSED TEST (number of files conformed to CCT table model): 4

FAILED TEST (number of files conformed to CCT table model): 0

CCT - Version 2018.2

<sup>1</sup> **MB** = Member body / **NC** = National Committee (enter the ISO 3166 two-letter country code, e.g. CN for China; comments from the ISO/CS editing unit are identified by \*\*)

<sup>2</sup> **Type of comment:** **ge** = general **te** = technical **ed** = editorial