



Systematic Review voting result

Reference	ISO/TS 12911:2012 (vers 2)	Committee	ISO/TC 59/SC 13
Edition number	1	Vienna agreement	
English title	Framework for building information modelling (BIM) guidance		
French title	Cadre pour les directives de modélisation des données du bâtiment		
Start date	2019-01-15	End date	2019-06-04
Opened on	2019-01-15 00:31:06	Closed on	
Status	Pending		
Voting stage	Systematic review	Version number	2
Vote in parallel with			
Note			

Questions	
Q.1	Recommended action
Q.2	Has this International Standard been adopted or is it intended to be adopted in the future as a national standard or other publication?
Q.3	Is the national publication identical to the International Standard or was it modified?
Q.4	If this International Standard has not been nationally adopted, is it applied or used in your country without national adoption or are products/processes/services used in your country based on this standard?
Q.5	Is this International Standard, or its national adoption, referenced in regulations in your country?
Q.6	If the committee decides to revise or amend, do you propose an expert and/or project leader for the development of that project?

Votes by members												
Country	Member	Status	Confirm	Revise / Amend	With-draw	Abstain lack of consensus	Abstain lack of national expert input	Q.2	Q.3	Q.4	Q.5	Q.6
Australia	SA	P-Member	X					No		No	No	No
Austria	ASI	P-Member					X	No		No	No	No
Belgium	NBN	P-Member		X				No		No	No	No
Brazil	ABNT	P-Member				X		No		No	No	No
Canada	SCC	P-Member					X	No		Yes	No	No
Chile	INN	P-Member		X				No		No	No	No

Votes by members												
Country	Member	Status	Confirm	Revise / Amend	Withdraw	Abstain lack of consensus	Abstain lack of national expert input	Q.2	Q.3	Q.4	Q.5	Q.6
China	SAC	P-Member		X				No		No	No	Yes (name(s) and
Czech Republic	UNMZ	P-Member					X	No		Yes	No	No
Denmark	DS	P-Member	X					No		No	No	No
Finland	SFS	P-Member				X		No		No	No	Yes (name(s) and
France	AFNOR	P-Member		X				No		Yes	No	No
Germany	DIN	P-Member		X				No		No	No	No
Hungary	MSZT	P-Member		X				No		No	No	No
Italy	UNI	P-Member					X	No		No	No	No
Japan	JISC	P-Member	X					No		No	No	Yes (name(s) and
Kazakhstan	KAZMEMS T	P-Member					X	No		No	No	No
Malaysia	DSM	P-Member					X	No		Yes	No	No
Netherlands	NEN	P-Member			X			Yes	Identical		No	No
Norway	SN	Secretariat			X			No		No	No	No
Peru	INACAL	P-Member					X	No		No	No	No
Portugal	IPQ	P-Member					X	No		No	No	No
Romania	ASRO	P-Member					X	No		No	No	No
Russian Federation	GOST R	P-Member					X	No		No	No	No
Singapore	SSC	P-Member	X					No		No	No	Yes (name(s) and
Slovenia	SIST	P-Member	X					No		No	No	No
Spain	UNE	P-Member	X					No		No	No	No
Sweden	SIS	P-Member			X			No		No	No	Yes (name(s) and
Switzerland	SNV	P-Member		X				No		No	No	No
Turkey	TSE	P-Member				X		Yes	Identical		No	No
United Kingdom	BSI	P-Member		X				Yes	Identical		No	Yes (name(s) and

Votes by members												
Country	Member	Status	Confirm	Revise / Amend	Withdraw	Abstain lack of consensus	Abstain lack of national expert input	Q.2	Q.3	Q.4	Q.5	Q.6
United States	ANSI	P-Member					X	No		No	No	No
P-Members TOTALS												
Total of P-Members voting (*) : 17												
Confirm : 6			6	8	3	3	11	3 Yes 28 No	3 Identical 0 Modified	4 Yes 24 No	0 Yes 31 No	6 Yes 25 No
Revise / Amend : 8												
Withdraw : 3												
TOTALS			6	8	3	3	11	3 Yes 28 No	3 Identical 0 Modified	4 Yes 24 No	0 Yes 31 No	6 Yes 25 No

(*): P-Members having abstained are not counted

Answers to Q.1: "Recommended action" (all votes)

3 x	Withdraw	Netherlands (NEN) Norway (SN) Sweden (SIS)
8 x	Revise / Amend	Belgium (NBN) Chile (INN) China (SAC) France (AFNOR) Germany (DIN) Hungary (MSZT) Switzerland (SNV) United Kingdom (BSI)
6 x	Confirm	Australia (SA) Denmark (DS) Japan (JISC) Singapore (SSC) Slovenia (SIST) Spain (UNE)
3 x	Abstain (consensus)	Brazil (ABNT) Finland (SFS) Turkey (TSE)
11 x	Abstain (expertise)	Austria (ASI) Canada (SCC) Czech Republic (UNMZ) Italy (UNI) Kazakhstan (KAZMEMST) Malaysia (DSM) Peru (INACAL) Portugal (IPQ) Romania (ASRO) Russian Federation (GOST R) United States (ANSI)

Comments

Australia (SA) Beazley, Deanna Mrs	While the technical specification has not been applied in Australia (to the committee's knowledge), it is a valuable framework which could assist the development of a BIM framework and should be retained.
Belgium (NBN) Michel, Catherine Mrs	Considering the evolution of BIM standards (EN ISO 19650 series, upcoming work at CEN/TC 442 and ISO/TC 59/SC 13) we feel it is important to thoroughly revise this standard, in the context of the current series of standards at ISO and CEN-level. The terminology should be evaluated against the current set of agreed terms & definitions (see CEN/TC 442/WG1 and ISO/TC 59/SC 13/TF1). The concepts of a BIM execution plan, a Common Data Environment and the Exchange Information Requirements, as the framework for Level of information need (in preparation by CEN/TC 442/WG2/TG1) should all be adopted and integrated into this standard, to better align with the current stage of affairs and understanding
Chile (INN) Rojas, Emilio Mr	This document can be useful as reference or complement to the national BIM standard
China (SAC) SONG, Jie Ms	this document was published seven years ago, when there was no clear and unified understanding of the implementation process of BIM in the worldwide. Therefore, this document plays a frame guiding role in the implementation of BIM. However, in recent years, BIM has gradually become mature and its methodology has become clear, some of which are beyond the framework of this standard.
France (AFNOR) Bonnin, Marguerite Mme	Revision of this document by updating vocabulary and definitions regarding other standards registered in ISO/TC 59/SC 13 working program, in order for ISO/TS 12911 to remain consistent with e.g. definitions in EN ISO 19650-1 and -2
Germany (DIN) Tiedtke, Sina Mrs Dipl.-Ing. (FH)	DIN didn't receive comments.
Hungary (MSZT) Bernáth, Csaba Mr	The Hungarian Mirror committee suggest to revise it due to publication of ISO 19650-1 and ISO 19650-2.

Answers to Q.1: "Recommended action" (all votes)	
Comments	
Netherlands (NEN) NEN, KID Ms	In my opinion this ISO/TS is overruled by the EN-ISO 19650-series and CEN/TC 442 initiatives (e.g. templates for EIR and BEP) based on EN-ISO 19650.
Norway (SN) Landfald, Lisbet Ms	This document is superseded by other standards and should be withdrawn.
Sweden (SIS) Mellgren, Linda Mrs	Replaced by ISO 19650.
Switzerland (SNV) Martino, Giuseppe Mr	Because of the publications of EN ISO 19650-1 and EN ISO 19650-2.

Answers to Q.2: "Has this International Standard been adopted or is it intended to be adopted in the future as a national standard or other publication?" (all votes)	
3 x Yes	Netherlands (NEN) Turkey (TSE) United Kingdom (BSI)
28 x No	Australia (SA) Austria (ASI) Belgium (NBN) Brazil (ABNT) Canada (SCC) Chile (INN) China (SAC) Czech Republic (UNMZ) Denmark (DS) Finland (SFS) France (AFNOR) Germany (DIN) Hungary (MSZT) Italy (UNI) Japan (JISC) Kazakhstan (KAZMEMST) Malaysia (DSM) Norway (SN) Peru (INACAL) Portugal (IPQ) Romania (ASRO) Russian Federation (GOST R) Singapore (SSC) Slovenia (SIST) Spain (UNE) Sweden (SIS) Switzerland (SNV) United States (ANSI)

Comments	
Australia (SA) Beazley, Deanna Mrs	No comment
Austria (ASI) Koellner, Gabriele Mrs	„Instead of this International Standard and keeping in mind that the use of standards is not compulsory either bilaterally agreed specifications (other documents than standards) or a relevant national/regional standard might be used.“
Belgium (NBN) Michel, Catherine Mrs	No. In Belgium, the intention is to continue developing national BIM Prototol and BIM Execution Plan documents, but also align them to ISO 19650 in the near future. This will be the national framework. National and regional policy documents are not available yet, but will be based on these.
Brazil (ABNT) Caetano, Brian Mr	our stakeholders are evaluating the possibility
Canada (SCC) Redekop, Quinn Mr	Although not adopted, parts of this standard are in use within Canada.
Chile (INN) Rojas, Emilio Mr	There is a public initiative for a national BIM standard, but does not include this document as reference.
China (SAC) SONG, Jie Ms	There are no plans to adopt this standard. The reason is that: 1) this document was published seven years ago, when there was no clear and unified understanding of the implementation process of BIM in the worldwide. Therefore, this document plays a frame guiding role in the implementation of BIM. However, in recent years, BIM has gradually become mature and its methodology has become clear, some of which are beyond the framework of this standard. 2) From the guidance provided by BIM, it can be seen in principle that the framework is defective and does not cover all the elements required by collaboration among multiple project participants. 3) Currently, BIM implementation and management processes are reflected in other ISO TC 59/SC 13 standards, such as ISO 19650 series, more detailed and more operational. 4) The basic framework of this standard has been reflected in the current national standard GB/T 51301-2018, architectural information model design delivery standard. 5) After the revision of this standard, the adoption of this standard shall be evaluated and considered according to the contents of the revision.

Answers to Q.2: "Has this International Standard been adopted or is it intended to be adopted in the future as a national standard or other publication?" (all votes)

Comments

China (SAC) SONG, Jie Ms	
Czech Republic (UNMZ) Kuklova, Lydie Mrs.	This International Standard is used the Czech Republic without national adoption
Denmark (DS) Trudsø, Erling Mr	-
Finland (SFS) Vuorinen, Pekka Mr.	No general need so far.
France (AFNOR) Bonnin, Marguerite Mme	because of its status of TS
Germany (DIN) Tiedtke, Sina Mrs Dipl.-Ing. (FH)	DIN didn't receive comments.
Hungary (MSZT) Bernáth, Csaba Mr	-
Italy (UNI) De Gregorio, Marco Mr	National and european standards
Japan (JISC) Hoshino, Masayuki Mr	No comment
Kazakhstan (KAZMEMST) Abaiuly, Bolat Mr	no comments
Malaysia (DSM) Mohamed, Mahadir Mr	DSM encourage direct use of international standards.
Netherlands (NEN) NEN, KID Ms	See above.
Norway (SN) Landfald, Lisbet Ms	If used, it is usen as ISO/TS.
Peru (INACAL) Guevara, Yuri Mr	Not planned yet.
Portugal (IPQ) Isidoro, Alexandra Mrs	No comments
Romania (ASRO) CHIREA, Cristina Mrs	no request from the stakeholders
Russian Federation (GOST R) Deryabina, Anastasiya Mrs	due to lack of national expert input
Singapore (SSC) Lim, Annie Ms	NA
Slovenia (SIST) Opaskar, Gorazd	we do not have any interest.
Spain (UNE) ARENAS, Jose Angel Mr	NO INTEREST
Sweden (SIS) Mellgren, Linda Mrs	Proprietary BIM manuals.
Switzerland (SNV) Martino, Giuseppe Mr	No, There is no request from national stakeholders.
Turkey (TSE) Inkaya, Tugba Ms	This standard will be adopt in the future
United Kingdom (BSI) Kosandiak, Stephanie Ms	PD ISO/TS 12911:2012

Answers to Q.2: "Has this International Standard been adopted or is it intended to be adopted in the future as a national standard or other publication?" (all votes)	
Comments	
United States (ANSI) Team, ANSI ISO	We are unaware of any intention to adopt this as a national publication.

Answers to Q.3: "Is the national publication identical to the International Standard or was it modified?" (all votes)	
3 x Identical	Netherlands (NEN) Turkey (TSE) United Kingdom (BSI)
0 x Modified	

Answers to Q.4: "If this International Standard has not been nationally adopted, is it applied or used in your country without national adoption or are products/processes/services used in your country based on this standard?" (all votes)	
4 x Yes	Canada (SCC) Czech Republic (UNMZ) France (AFNOR) Malaysia (DSM)
24 x No	Australia (SA) Austria (ASI) Belgium (NBN) Brazil (ABNT) Chile (INN) China (SAC) Denmark (DS) Finland (SFS) Germany (DIN) Hungary (MSZT) Italy (UNI) Japan (JISC) Kazakhstan (KAZMEMST) Norway (SN) Peru (INACAL) Portugal (IPQ) Romania (ASRO) Russian Federation (GOST R) Singapore (SSC) Slovenia (SIST) Spain (UNE) Sweden (SIS) Switzerland (SNV) United States (ANSI)
Comments	
Canada (SCC) Redekop, Quinn Mr	Parts of this standard are in use within Canada.
Czech Republic (UNMZ) Kuklova, Lydie Mrs.	This International Standard is used the Czech Republic without national adoption
France (AFNOR) Bonnin, Marguerite Mme	it is applied /used without national adoption
Malaysia (DSM) Mohamed, Mahadir Mr	Yes - by the construction industry

Answers to Q.5: "Is this International Standard, or its national adoption, referenced in regulations in your country?" (all votes)	
0 x Yes	
31 x No	Australia (SA) Austria (ASI) Belgium (NBN) Brazil (ABNT) Canada (SCC) Chile (INN) China (SAC) Czech Republic (UNMZ) Denmark (DS) Finland (SFS) France (AFNOR) Germany (DIN) Hungary (MSZT) Italy (UNI) Japan (JISC) Kazakhstan (KAZMEMST) Malaysia (DSM) Netherlands (NEN) Norway (SN) Peru (INACAL) Portugal (IPQ) Romania (ASRO) Russian Federation (GOST R) Singapore (SSC) Slovenia (SIST) Spain (UNE) Sweden (SIS) Switzerland (SNV) Turkey (TSE) United Kingdom (BSI) United States (ANSI)

Answers to Q.6: "If the committee decides to revise or amend, do you propose an expert and/or project leader for the development of that project?" (all votes)	
6 x Yes	China (SAC) Finland (SFS) Japan (JISC) Singapore (SSC) Sweden (SIS) United Kingdom (BSI)
25 x No	Australia (SA) Austria (ASI) Belgium (NBN) Brazil (ABNT) Canada (SCC) Chile (INN) Czech Republic (UNMZ) Denmark (DS) France (AFNOR) Germany (DIN) Hungary (MSZT) Italy (UNI) Kazakhstan (KAZMEMST) Malaysia (DSM) Netherlands (NEN) Norway (SN) Peru (INACAL) Portugal (IPQ) Romania (ASRO) Russian Federation (GOST R) Slovenia (SIST) Spain (UNE) Switzerland (SNV) Turkey (TSE) United States (ANSI)
Comments	
China (SAC) SONG, Jie Ms	The expert will determined in the later.
Finland (SFS) Vuorinen, Pekka Mr.	Expert: Tomi Henttinen Gravicon Ltd. tomi.henttinen@gravicon.fi

Answers to Q.6: "If the committee decides to revise or amend, do you propose an expert and/or project leader for the development of that project? " (all votes)

Comments

Japan (JISC) Hoshino, Masayuki Mr	We propose Tatsuo Terai as expert
Singapore (SSC) Lim, Annie Ms	Dr David Chua - Project leader Ar. William Lau - Project leader
Sweden (SIS) Mellgren, Linda Mrs	Mr Rogier Jongeling
United Kingdom (BSI) Kosandiak, Stephanie Ms	Mr Nick Nisbet - nick@nicknisbet.com

Comment files from voters

United Kingdom (BSI) Kosandiak, Stephanie Ms	See linked comment file: <i>ISO TS 12911 2012 (vers 2) BSI.doc</i> (access restricted to ballot audience)
---	--